

Chullin – Simanim

פרק ה – אותו ואת בנו

דף פב – 82 Daf

1. *Machlokes* if עגלה ערופה becomes prohibited while it is alive

The Mishnah lists *shechting* an עגלה ערופה as a שחיטה שאינה ראויה. The Gemara objects from a Mishnah: that if the murderer was found before the עגלה was decapitated, it returns to the flock, because the עגלה remains permitted until its decapitation. If so, *shechting* it should permit it in consumption!? Reish Lakish quotes Rebbe Yannai saying that עגלה ערופה should be removed from the Mishnah's text. However, the Gemara disproves this attribution. Rebbe Yannai said: גבול שמעתי בה ושכחתי – *I heard what is the cutoff line for when [עגלה ערופה] becomes forbidden, but I forgot what it is, and it was determined that ירידתה לנחל איתן אוסרתה – its descent to the hard valley is what prohibits it.* Therefore, Rebbe Yannai could have interpreted our Mishnah to refer to *shechting* an עגלה ערופה after its descent to the נחל איתן. Reish Lakish derives the prohibition of מצורע – צפורי מצורע – *birds used for the purification משעת לקיחה – from the time of their taking* for עגלה ערופה, which is likewise forbidden while alive. Therefore, the Gemara concludes that it is Rebbe Yochanan who removed "עגלה ערופה" from our Mishnah.

2. Multiple violations of אותו ואת בנו with a single *shechitah*

The Mishnah states that one who *shechts* a cow and its two calves the same day incurs two sets of *malkus*, but one who *shechted* the two calves and then the mother (which was forbidden for two reasons), incurs only one. If one *shechted* a cow, its daughter, and its daughter's daughter, he incurs two sets of *malkus*, but if he *shechted* a cow and its "granddaughter" first, and then its daughter (thereby violating two prohibitions simultaneously), the Tanna Kamma obligates one set of *malkus*, but סומכוס obligates two sets. [סומכוס would also argue in the רישא and say that one who *shechts* two calves and then the mother receives two sets of *malkus*.] The Mishnah clearly assumes one is liable for *shechting* offspring and then its mother, and the Gemara asks that the Torah only forbids *shechting* "אותו – *it and its offspring*, but not "בנו ואותו" – *its offspring and it!*? It answers that the plural phrase "לא תשחטו" – *you shall not shecht* implies that two people can be liable for *shechting*, i.e., where a cow was *shechted*, and then one *shechted* its mother, and another *shechted* its offspring.

3. אבל שני זיתי חלב בהעלם אחד

Abaye asked Rav Yosef why Sumchos obligates two sets of *malkus* for *shechting* the daughter after *shechting* the "grandmother" and "granddaughter." Does he hold חטאת אחד חייב שתי חטאות – if *one ate two כדיתים בזיתים* – *if one ate two כדיתים in one lapse of awareness, he is liable to two חטאות* (and similarly, two intentional transgressions of the same prohibition in one act obligates two sets of *malkus*)? Or, does Sumchos agree that one who eats two כדיתים of חלב in one העלם is only liable to one חטאת, and he obligates two sets of *malkus* in the Mishnah מוחלקין – *because the multiple transgressions result from acts in separate bodies* (i.e., *shechting* the daughter violates *shechting* it the same day as its mother, and *shechting* it the same day as its daughter)? Rav Yosef replied that סומכוס indeed holds that eating two כדיתים of חלב in one העלם obligates two חטאות. However, every proof to this assertion is deflected.

Siman – Peanut Butter

The man who made the עגלה ערופה *assur* in benefit by bringing it down to **Peanut Butter Valley**, watched as his friend who used a **peanut buttery knife** to *shecht* a cow after *shechting* its daughter and mother was about to receive two sets of *malkus*, after he ate two *kezaisim* of *cheilev* in **peanut butter sandwiches** making him liable for another two sets.

DAF 82 | דף פב

Peanut Butter



The man who made the עגלה ערופה assur in benefit by bringing it down to **Peanut Butter Valley**, watched as his friend who used a **peanut buttery knife** to shecht a cow after shechting its daughter and mother was about to receive two sets of *malkus*, after he ate two *kezaisim* of *cheilev* in **peanut butter** sandwiches אחד בהעלם making him liable for another two sets.

3 things to remember

1. *Machlokes* if עגלה ערופה becomes prohibited while it is alive
2. Multiple violations of אותו ואת בנו with a single *shechitah*
3. אכל שני זיתי חלב בהעלם אחד

